

MINUTES
CITY PLAN COMMISSION/ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD
OCTOBER 19, 2021
ZOOM MEETING

The City Plan Commission/Architectural Review Board of the City of Clayton, Missouri, met on the above date at 1720 hours via a zoom meeting. Upon roll call, the following responded:

Present:

Steve Lichtenfeld, Chairman
David Gipson, City Manager
Ira Berkowitz, Aldermanic Representative
Helen DiFate
George Hettich
Bob Denlow
Carolyn Gaidis

Also in Attendance:

Susan M. Istenes, AICP, Planning Director
Annisa Kumerow, Principal Planner
Stephanie Karr, City Attorney

MINUTES

The minutes from September 20, 2021 and October 4, 2021 were approved unanimously.
Steve Lichtenfeld, Chairman welcomed everyone to the meeting.

OLD BUSINESS

448 EDGEWOOD DRIVE – ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW – EXTERIOR ALTERATION

Annisa Kumerow summarized the staff report.

Jeffrey Mayer, property owner, was present.

Matthew Fulbright from Bright- Mann Contracting, was present.

Steve Lichtenfeld – asked if the retaining wall stone is natural or painted and what kind of mortar.

Jeffrey Mayer – answered, it's natural stone that is a gray color and the concrete mortar will match.

Helen DiFate – asked if the drainage would be onto the sidewalk or neighbor's lawn.

Matthew Fulbright – stated it will drain 3-5 feet from the city sidewalk but not on the sidewalk.

Steve Lichtenfeld – asks for a motion since there are no other comments or questions.

Carolyn Gaidis made a motion to approve as submitted. Bob Denlow seconded the motion, the motion to approve was unanimously approved by the Board.

132 N MERAMEC AVE – ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW – EXTERIOR ALTERATION

Annisa Kumerow summarized the staff report.

Nick Ellis, BEX contractor, was present.

Charlie Nicholls, Vice President of the animal hospital, was also present.

Steve Lichtenfeld – asked if the property goes to the north.

Nick Ellis – no

Steve Lichtenfeld – asked what 136 N. Meramec will be used for.

Nick Ellis – I don't know. They are moving the business to 132 but I don't know what 136 will be used for.

Steve Lichtenfeld – asked about the turf area behind the building.

Nick Ellis – it will be available to the animals accompanied by employees.

Steve Lichtenfeld – there may need to be a receptacle.

Charlie Nicholls – BCA will remain owner of both buildings. There will be stations with bags and receptacles.

Charlie Nicholls – asked if repairing the fence would require the same permit as replacing it.

Annisa Kumerow – yes.

Carolyn Gaidis – asked how the exterior of the building was changed without approval from the board.

Charles Nicholls – The original plan was to repair the siding and windows. When the architect started repairing, it became apparent that the damage was extensive and had to be replaced. I am not sure why BEX did not get proper approval.

Nick Ellis – the new roof was approved, and the siding color was approved but no official approval was made.

Carolyn Gaidis – asked if a tree service was lined up.

Nick Ellis – Yes, Baxter Farms.

Carolyn Gaidis – asked so prior to anything you will get approval for the trees.

Nick Ellis – yes.

Ira Berkowitz – asked if the windows are wood clad.

Nick Ellis – No, they are vinyl windows.

Ira Berkowitz – I thought vinyl windows were not allowed by this board.

Steve Lichtenfeld – they need to be vinyl clad wood windows.

Nick Ellis – all of this was sent to Susan.

Susan Istenes – I did not approve any of this. No permit was issued.

Steve Lichtenfeld – this is a problem. We're not approving full vinyl windows.

Bob Denlow – it's a balancing act. I think it's a big expense and we should overlook it. I don't see much harm. We can move forward without causing hardship.

Susan Istenes – this board has the authority to approve alternatives.

Carolyn Gaidis – asked if a precedent would be set. The next person wanting to use vinyl windows can point to this approval.

Bob Denlow – that's a red herring argument. We must ask what was not approved? What is the significance? It's a great expense to rip out windows for non-compliance.

Ira Berkowitz – I don't totally disagree. I have a problem with asking forgiveness of something they would not have gotten permission for. Are we setting a precedent for bypassing the process we have here?

Bob Denlow – Window trim is really pushing the limits of setting precedent. The windows are done and from my perspective it's not a big deal.

Ira Berkowitz – I just remember an hour-long discussion about windows and what would be permitted.

Charles Nicholls – the intention was not to do a bait and switch. The further we got into repair, the worse it got. I am disappointed it didn't go through an approval process. It was nothing intentional from our end.

Carolyn Gaidis – asked where do we go from here for all the changes made without approval?

Susan Istenes – I can't speak for the precedent. This board does have approval authority for alternative materials.

Stephanie Karr – A future case would have to show circumstances were the same as this issue to argue precedent.

Bob Denlow – I was on the Board of Adjustment. There was never an issue of an adjustment setting a precedent. All buildings are unique.

Steve Lichtenfeld – asked Charles Nicholls if he was familiar with the staff recommendations.

Charles Nicholls – asked if he meant the fence.

Steve Lichtenfeld – pine trees, fence, and CUP change of ownership.

Charles Nicholls – yes, I'll follow up with legal about the CUP change right away.

Steve Lichtenfeld – I think we need to uphold our standards but also need to consider our ability to approve alternatives.

Hearing no further questions or comments from the Board and no comments from the audience, Bob Denlow, made a motion to approve with the staff's 3 recommendations. Carolyn Gaidis seconded the motion. The motion was approved with Ira Berkowitz opposing.

NEW BUSINESS

21 ABERDEEN PLACE – ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD – GARAGE AND DRIVEWAY RENOVATION

Annisa Kumerow summarized the staff report.

Chris and Elizabeth Cardinal, property owners, were present.

Steve Lichtenfeld – asked if the driveway was shared.

Elizabeth Cardinal – yes

Steve Lichtenfeld – asked if making the driveway wider would make it 2 cars wide.

Elizabeth Cardinal – no, it just makes it easier to get in and out.

Steve Lichtenfeld – asked if they will be able to make a 3-point turn and drive forward out of the wider driveway or if they will have to back out.

Elizabeth Cardinal – we will be able to do a 3-point turn and come out of the driveway forward.

Hearing no further questions or comments from the Board and hearing no further comments from the audience, Carolyn Gaidis, made a motion to approve as submitted. Helen DiFate seconded the motion, the motion was unanimously approved by the Board.

16 BRENTMOOR PARK – LANDSCAPING AND EXTERIOR RENOVATION

Annisa Kumerow summarized the staff report.

Wes Haid, architect, was present.

Steve Lichtenfeld – asked if the pergola is within the building line.

Wes Haid – it's 2 feet inside the building setback line.

Helen DiFate – asked if a structural engineer was going to look at the cabana.

Wes Haid – yes

Ira Berkowitz – asked how the drainage works.

Wes Haid – the cabana has gutters and rain chains on the back that tie into an underdrain.

Hearing no further questions or comments from the Board and hearing no comments from the audience, Carolyn Gaidis, made a motion to approve as submitted. Ira Berkowitz seconded the motion; the motion was unanimously approved by the Board.

1 OAK KNOLL PARK – PAVILLION CONSTRUCTION, LANDSCAPING, AND POND RENOVATION

Annisa Kumerow summarized the staff report.

Patty DeForrest, Parks Director, was present.

Ted Spaid, SWT Design, was also present.

Patty DeForrest – added to the staff report that tuckpointing and a leak in the pond would also be fixed along with the improvements.

Ted Spaid – added they would be making the sidewalk around the pond ADA compliant and correcting some hodge podge areas. He went over the site plan in detail.

Patty DeForrest – we tried to match the pavilion to the larger buildings.

Steve Lichtenfeld – looks great and adds functionality. Can the shelter also be used for performance?

Patty DeForrest – I'm not sure if it will end up being used that way or not.

Ted Spaid – there will be electrical outlets in the pavilion so it's possible.

Carolyn Gaidis – asked what the timeline is.

Patty DeForrest – we'll be doing some in-house work on the pond this fall. The construction will be in the spring.

Carolyn Gaidis – asked what kind of plants are going to be planted.

Ted Spaid – butterfly milkweed, native grass material. The donor was interested in butterfly and bird attraction.

Carolyn Gaidis – asked if it would be possible to let Clayton school children design the stencils for the stamped concrete.

Ted Spaid – it's a possibility. We were going to use the leaves of plants in the park and nearby animal prints. Kids could even be the ones to collect the leaves.

George Hettich – express our thanks to the donor.

Hearing no further questions or comments from the Board and hearing no comments from the audience, Carolyn Gaidis, made a motion to approve as submitted. Bob Denlow seconded the motion; the motion was unanimously approved by the Board.

400 S MERAMEC AVE – CONSTRUCTION OF NEW ENTRANCE AND OFFICE

Annisa Kumerow summarized the staff report.

Eric Wilson, architect, was present.

Mary Jo Gruber, Clayton School District, was also present.

Steve Lichtenfeld – asked if the administrative office was being moved.

Eric Wilson – yes, currently the office is in the center of one wing. This new office will also be the new main entrance to the school.

Steve Lichtenfeld – asked if they would be reusing the existing canopy and if it would be reworked.

Eric Wilson – we're going to rebuild it in the same style.

Steve Lichtenfeld – asked what will happen to the entrances on the west side of the school.

Eric Wilson – they will still be used for entrance and release during the school day, but signage will direct people to the new entrance.

Steve Lichtenfeld – That will be more secure.

Hearing no further questions or comments from the Commission and hearing no comments from the audience, Carolyn Gaidis, made a motion to approve as submitted. Bob Denlow seconded the motion; the motion was unanimously approved by the Board.

OTHER BUSINESS

George Hettich presented the code section on off street parking and loading regulations.

Meeting adjourned at 1916 hours.